Annex B. Rubric for OER quality assessment

1. Content

- 1.1 The title of the resource is motivating and suggestive.
 - 1. The title is too simple and it is not motivating at all.
 - 3. The title reflects the content well but it does not motivate enough.
 - 5. The title reflects the content and it arouses interest in an attractive way.
- 1.2 The cover is presented in a suggestive way, in accordance with the content of the resource.
 - 1. The cover does not attract attention and barely describes the content.
 - 3. The cover makes the content and learnings of the resource clear, but it does not do so in an attractive way.
 - 5. The cover is designed in an attractive way, it clarifies what learnings the resource generates and what is the general action that should be carried out by the agents to whom it is addressed.
- 1.3 The content is not ideological; it is objective.
 - 1. The content is not acceptable. It is not respectful. The content is discriminatory towards some groups. It is oriented towards a certain ideology in an unobjective way.
 - 3. If the content is not offensive, it can be treated.
 - 5. Regardless of whether the content is not ideological, it will be equally objective.
- 1.4 The content is consistent with the didactic objectives and purpose of the resource.
 - 1. The content and the educational objectives do not have any connection with the purpose of the resource.
 - 3. There is a relationship between the content and the educational objectives, but they do not fully adapt to the purpose of the resource.
 - 5. If each learning objective is worked with at least a didactical content, an activity, an exercise, or a practical issue, and the content is presented in a total coherence with the purpose of the resource.
- 1.5 The content is presented in a clear and understandable way. They highlight key ideas and give clear instructions for activities.
 - 1. The language used is searched back and is not suitable for the recipients. The presentation is not well organized.
 - 3. The content is understandable to the recipients as long as reasonable efforts are made to fully understand it.
 - 5. The language used is understandable and appropriate for the recipients. Key ideas are easily localized, and the content is very well organized.
- 1.6 The contents are presented in an attractive or innovative way, with options to capture the interest of the student.
 - 1. The content is presented in an excessively scientific and excessively traditional way.
 - 3. The content will be contextualized enough to generate some interest.
 - 5. The content is presented with examples and illustrations capable of capturing the interest of the student in an attractive and innovative way.
- 1.7 There is a relationship between what is learned and the student's life environment (the information connects with the interests and social reality of the student).
 - 1. The content differs greatly from the social reality of the student and does not connect with their interests.
 - 3. The content is not far from the interests of the student.
 - 5. The content is adapted to the social reality of the student and connects with all their interests, offering the student the opportunity to address problems in a real context.

1.8 The necessary knowledge is clearly presented at the beginning.

- 1. No prior knowledge necessary to understand the topic is given.
- 3. Prior knowledge is not sufficiently clear, is not essential for the understanding of the topic, or does not fully respond to the necessary content.
- 5. Some basic contents are given at the beginning of the topic, which are perfectly defined to be able to understand and follow the topic.

1.9 Content can be used regardless of teaching and learning methods.

- 1. The resource defines a very marked teaching and learning process. The content of the resource cannot be adapted to other methods.
- 3. The contents listed in the resource can, at some points, be used independently, while others are related to the teaching-learning process used in the resource.
- 5. The user can utilize the contents of the resource as they see fit and completely independently of any teaching-learning process.

1.10 The presented content is updated.

- 1. The contents presented in the resource are not in line with the present day, they are out of touch with the real context.
- 3. The contents are fairly neutral in general, but some parts are a little out of date.
- 5. The content is scientifically up to date, adapted to the real context and the current situation.

1.11 The content is errors/typos free.

- 1. There are scientific, spelling, syntactic, morphological, content updating, etc. errors in the presented content.
- 3. The content does not contain errors but lacks scientific rigour.
- 5. The content is presented with scientific, syntactic and morphological rigour.

1.12 The material contains references to updated scientific literature.

- 1. The bibliographic references are not current, they are out of date with the material contained in the resource.
- 3. The bibliographic references are not out of date but can be updated to make the resource as up to date as possible.
- 5. All bibliographic references are up to date.

1.13 Explicit specification of the target audience.

- 1. The target audience is not specified or the intended user is not considered in the development
- 3. Reference is made to the user but the content of the resource does not fully adapt to it.
- 5. The entire resource is perfectly designed for the intended user and designed for them to develop their teaching-learning process.

1.14 The actual level of the material corresponds to the indicated level.

- 1. The material included in the resource has a level that is too low or much higher than the indicated reference level in terms of content and vocabulary.
- 3. The material in the resource could be better adapted to the level indicated.
- 5. The material has exactly the level that has been indicated.

1.15 The resource must be self-contained.

- 1. Other supporting materials must be utilised in order to use the material contained in the resource.
- 3. At some points, some supporting material is needed to use the resource.
- 5. No additional material is needed for the content of the resource to be usable, it is self-contained.

1.16 The resource contains adaptive or additional content that allows adapting to different previous knowledge.

- 1. The resource does not have any extra material that makes it useful for users with different backgrounds.
- 3. For users with prior knowledge, the resource has a small amount of extra material to fill in the gaps.
- 5. The resource contains extra material that is sufficient to achieve the required background knowledge.

2. Didactics

2.1 The teaching objectives are defined clearly and precisely.

- 1. The objectives of the resource are not specified.
- 3. The objectives are not precise enough, and, sometimes may be difficult for the user to understand.
- 5. The objectives that are presented are very understandable and precise, providing the user at all times with a very good understanding of the reason for the contents of the resource.

2.2 The educational objectives are achievable by the recipient.

- 1. The level of the objectives or the way they are defined is not appropriate to the content of the resource, they cannot be achieved.
- 3. The definition of the objectives is not entirely adequate, with the resource it is difficult to be achieved by the user.
- 5. The objectives are perfectly achievable by the user, they are all designed and intended for this to be carried out.

2.3 The skills and/or skills to be developed are clearly specified, consistent with the objectives and recipients.

- 1. The skills to be worked on with the resource are not clearly defined, which means that they are not coherent with the defined objectives and the profile of the user who will use the resource is not taken into account.
- 3. Skills and/or competences are defined but are only partially matched to the objectives and to the users of the resource.
- 5. It is easy for the target audience to see the coherence established between the objectives and the competences of the resource. This enables the user to develop and achieve the competences.

2.4 The content of the OER is adapted to the prior knowledge specified at the beginning.

- 1. No prior knowledge to be able to use and understand the content of the presented resource is found or defined.
- 3. The prior knowledge that the user should have attained before using the resource is not well defined or is not fully complete.
- 5. The prior knowledge that should be known before being able to use the resource is very clear, and the content of the resource is a continuation of this knowledge.

2.5 There is coherence between theory and practice.

- 1. The activities or practical parts are not related to the theory and the objectives of the resource.
- 3. Some practical part is not sufficiently coherent with the theory, which makes difficult the achievement of the teaching-learning process.
- 5. The contents, objectives, competences and activities are all consistent. The activities are designed so that the user achieves the necessary skills, as well as the objectives and content listed in the resource.

2.6 The active role of students is prioritized, through the use of active methodologies and experience-based learning.

- 1. There is no active methodology that makes the learner learn through their own experience or experience in today's world. The methodology is static, not dynamic.
- 3. There is some part with active methodologies that make the learner to develop an active role in the teaching-learning process.
- 5. Priority is given to the active role of the students by means of different active methodologies and dynamic learning through different experiences in a real context.

2.7 It includes actions to boost reflection on learning.

- 1. The resource is descriptive and does not include actions to enable students to reflect on and reason about the teaching-learning process.
- 3. It includes some methodology that enables learners to start reflecting in order to achieve and develop their learning.
- 5. The whole resource is designed so that students can enhance and consolidate the reflection of different situations on their teaching-learning process.

2.8 It includes motivational tasks, situations, or motivating questions.

- 1. The resource becomes tiresome and monotonous to follow, there is a lack of activities, contextualised situations and resources that motivate students.
- 3. There is a lack of some other activities and resources to arouse the interest of the student.
- 5. The tasks, activities and resources provided in the resource are adequate to arouse the full interest of the student. The resource includes motivating activities that are from the learner's own experiences or interests.

2.9 The tasks include clear and direct instructions.

- 1. The tasks found within the resource are difficult to follow and implement, the instructions are not understandable and are not dealt with in a straightforward way.
- 3. The instructions in the resource could be improved so that students can carry out their tasks correctly.
- 5. All instructions for completing the tasks are written in a very precise, clear and easy to understand way.

2.10 The evaluable tasks specify the evaluation criteria and evaluation tools that are incorporated into the resources.

- 1. When assessing the tasks, they do not specify in a clear and understandable way the criteria and the instruments that will be used.
- 3. The criteria and instruments to be used to correctly evaluate the tasks designed within the resource are confusing.
- 5. It is specified in a precise and understandable way how the tasks within the resource are to be assessed so that the students can understand everything perfectly.

2.11 It promotes the meaningful learning of the student.

- 1. The resource leads to superficial learning; its design lacks the incorporation of tasks, situations, activities, active methodologies... that make students develop significant learning.
- 3. The resource partially promotes significant student learning. The resource lacks active methodologies that make this happen.
- 5. The resource is conceived and designed in its entirety to promote significant learning.

2.12 It stimulates critical thinking and analytical skills.

- 1. The resource lacks competency-based learning situations contextualised in a real context, active methodologies, motivation, etc. so that the students can reach a critical and reflective capacity.
- 3. The proposals within the resource are not sufficiently developed to stimulate the critical and reflective capacity of the students.
- 5. The resource is perfectly designed for students to develop critical and reflective thinking through different types of contextualised activities.

2.13 It encourages creativity and innovation.

- 1. There is a lack of didactic proposals of different types to develop motivation and interest in order to achieve creativity and innovation on the part of the student.
- 3. It is necessary to develop in more detail activities that promote the creativity and innovation of the resource
- 5. The whole methodology and the overall design of the resource is perfectly designed to awaken the innovation and creativity of the pupils

2.14 The evaluation corresponds to the expected learning level.

- 1. The designs of the learning assessment rubrics do not correspond to the level of learning that the resource allows to be achieved (by default or by excess).
- 3. The assessment is not entirely in line with the level that the resource allows to reach.
- 5. The resource contains forms of learning assessment adapted to the content. Questions are asked about everything that has been explained at the level at which it has been explained.

2.15 The resource promotes teamwork.

- 1. The design of the resource does not include cooperative work and teamwork. There is a lack of dynamic activities to promote this by exchanging knowledge among students, developing their learning capacity.
- 3. The resource contains some activities designed to be done in teams in a dynamic, collaborative and interactive way.

5. The resource is designed to promote teamwork by facilitating the interaction of different people on a continuous basis through the use of digital, interactive platforms and ICT resources.

2.16 The resource provides automatic feedback.

- 1. The resource does not provide automatic feedback as the tasks and activities are not appropriately designed and evaluated to make this possible.
- 3. It does not promote feedback sufficiently or in a sufficiently agile way, so that students must be provided with rapid feedback to accelerate and consolidate their learning pace.
- 5. The resource with new active methodologies promotes that students have agile and effective feedback.

2.17 It is well known who can be addressed in case of errors, doubts, etc.

- 1. The resource does not provide any mechanism that the student can turn to in the event that, when using the resource, they have any doubts about the content or even encounter any type of error of different typology.
- 3. The mechanism provided by the resource is not sufficiently agile for the student to receive a response in the shortest possible time.
- 5. For all errors, doubts... whether technical or content-related, the resource makes it easy for the learner to ask questions and receive an answer in the shortest possible time. At all times, it is clear where to go in the resource and the access is also very clear.

2.18 The material is presented through practical examples.

- 1. The material is entirely theoretical.
- 3. The material contains sporadic examples for some parts of the content.
- 5. The theoretical content of the resource is illustrated with practical examples that act as a guiding thread. These examples can be of different types and are perfectly suited to the content of the resource.

2.19 The material offers help among glossaries, summaries, definitions, etc.

- 1. There is a lack of supporting materials for a full understanding of the content of the resource.
- 3. The support materials contained in the resource are not sufficient, they are not of much help.
- 5. All the material is thought and designed to offer students additional help and support so that they can consolidate all the knowledge they have acquired.

3. Technical characteristics

- 3.1 The feature is technically robust: it does not fail during its operation.
 - 1. The resource during its operation presents technical errors and is often affected by user errors.
 - 3. The resource may present technical errors that cause the user to be affected and unable to carry out their learning process.
 - 5. The resource is reliable, has no technical errors and therefore is not affected by user errors.
- 3.2 The resource is made with a tool that allows and facilitates its modification by other users.
 - 1. The resource is designed in such a way that it cannot be modified by users.
 - 3. The resource can be partially modified by the user depending on which tool is used.
 - 5. The resource is designed with a tool that allows and facilitates its modification.
- 3.3 It allows export to standard formats, including educational standards.
 - 1. It cannot be exported to any kind of format, not even standard formats.
 - 3. It can be exported in some standard formats, although not all are possible.
 - 5. Export to all standard formats is possible, including educational standards.
- 3.4 It is easily navigable.
 - 1. It is difficult to navigate easily through the resource.
 - 3. It is often possible to navigate around the resource although the navigation route can be improved considerably.
 - 5. The resource is easily navigable, facilitating the teaching-learning process for the user.
- 3.5 It is intuitive.
 - 1. It is difficult to get around the content of the resource; it is not intuitive. It is not obvious.
 - 3. The content is not presented in a sufficiently intuitive way; it is necessary to navigate further within the resource.
 - 5. It is totally obvious and intuitive. The content is very easy to follow
- 3.6 There is homogeneity in design.
 - 1. The design of the resource is not the same everywhere, it does not follow a homogeneity.
 - 3. The format in which the design of the resource is made does not present sufficient homogeneity.
 - 5. The resource is completely homogeneous, which facilitates its understanding in its entirety.
- 3.7 The navigation is fast.
 - 1. The resource cannot be navigated quickly.
 - 3. You have to find a shortcut to be able to navigate quickly.
 - 5. Navigating the resource is too fast.
- 3.8 The Metadata contains descriptions of its main characteristics in accordance with international standards.
 - 1. The characteristics of the metadata do not match international standards.
 - 3. There are characteristics of the metadata that are not in accordance with international standards.
 - 5. The characteristics of the metadata are consistent with all international standards.
- 3.9 Content can be customized in design without losing structure or information.
 - 1. By customising the design of the resource, its original structure and information are lost.
 - 3. Depending on what is customised in the design, the original information and structure change.
 - 5. Any modification made to the design of the resource allows the original structure and information to be maintained.
- 3.10 It is clearly described which technical requirements are necessary for the use of the
 - 1. It does not clearly describe the technical features to be used for the resource to work properly.
 - 3. Many technical features to make the resource work properly are not described.

5. The resource clearly describes what the technical requirements are for the resource to function correctly.

3.11 The use of the feature does not require any additional software.

- 1. Specific software is required to be able to use the resource.
- 3. The resource can be used according to the type of software.
- 5. No additional software is required for the resource to function.

3.12 The feature is presented correctly and is compatible with common operating systems.

- 1. The resource is not correctly defined and is not compatible with the most commonly used operating systems.
- 3. The resource is not very well defined and is not compatible with standard operating systems.
- 5. The resource is defined and presented correctly, and is also compatible with any operating system including the standard operating system.

3.13 The content can be found through a search function.

- 1. No search function is defined within the resource, and therefore it does not facilitate the user to find the it easily.
- 3. The content search function is not sufficiently effective.
- 5. The contents can be easily found; a search function is defined within the resource.

3.14 You can interrupt the learning sequence at any time and continue later in the same place.

- 1. Once the resource is being used, the student's learning sequence cannot be interrupted, as it would then be very difficult to continue where the user left off.
- 3. It is difficult to recover the learning sequence where it had previously been interrupted.
- 5. Once the resource is being used, the users can at any time interrupt the learning sequence and then return to the point where they left off.

3.15 The material contains interactive elements that can be changed by entering or selecting parameters or data.

- 1. The resource does not contain interactive elements that can be changed by inputting or selecting parameters or data.
- 3. The resource contains some interactive elements that may be subject to some modification by entering or selecting parameters or data.
- 5. The resource contains many interactive elements.

4. Accessibility

- 4.1 The text is readable or can be adjusted in size.
 - 1. The text is very difficult to read and cannot be adjusted in size.
 - 3. The text can be followed but often cannot be adjusted in size.
 - 5. Text is very easy to read and can be easily adjusted in size.

4.2 There is a contrast between the text colour and the background colour to read it clearly and effortlessly.

- 1. The colour contrast between the text that is written and the background colour makes it difficult to read it in a plain way.
- 3. The colour contrast between the text and the background is not optimal, but it is still readable.
- 5. There is contrast between the colour of the text and the background colour, which makes it easy to read without any effort.

4.3 In case of having images that depend on colour to transmit information, this is tailored to the needs of visually

- 1. If in the resource there are images that colour has the fundamental role of transmitting information, the colour is not what it should be so that colour-blind people can understand it.
- 3. If in the resource there are images that colour has the fundamental role of transmitting information, it is not sufficiently appropriate and therefore not what it should be so that colour-blind people can understand it and grasp everything it means.
- 5. If in the resource there are images where colour has the relevant role of transmitting information, it is the most appropriate for colour-blind people.

4.4 The written texts follow recommendations for easy reading, according to the target audience.

- 1. The texts found in the resource do not follow the recommendations for 'easy reading' by the target user.
- 3. The texts do follow some of the 'easy reading' recommendations.
- 5. The written texts follow the recommendations indicated within the 'easy read' resource.

4.5 All the audio-visual content (video, graphics, figures, etc.) has an alternative text description.

- 1. The audio-visual resources within the resource do not present any alternative textual description.
- 3. The alternative textual description presented by the audio-visual resources within the resource is not sufficient.
- 5. The audio-visual resources all have an alternative textual description that facilitates their understanding.

4.6 The images and videos contain explanatory texts.

- 1. The images and videos in the resource do not have explanations to help their understanding.
- 3. The explanations found in the images and videos are not sufficiently elaborated with content.
- 5. The images and videos found within the resource have well elaborated explanations that facilitate understanding.

4.7 The tables are incorporated directly into the resource, not the image.

- 1. The tables found in the resource are images.
- 3. Not all tables are directly embedded, some are images.
- 5. The tables are not images but are incorporated directly into the resource.

4.8 The material contains multiple presentations that can be consulted interactively.

- 1. The resource material is made up of a single presentation.
- 3. The resource material does not have a sufficient number of presentations for the user to be able to consult them.
- 5. The material contains many and varied presentations so that they can be consulted interactively by the users.

- 4.9 All functions can be accessed through the keyboard or alternative operations.
 - 1. Not all functionality is accessible via keyboard or alternative operations.
 - 3. All functionality cannot be sufficiently accessed through the keyboard or through alternative operations.
 - $5. \ All \ functionality \ can \ be \ accessed \ through \ the \ keyboard \ or \ through \ alternative \ operations.$

5. Inclusive Communication

5.1 The content is included considering the gender perspective.

- 1. The contents that are included do not consider the gender perspective.
- 3. The contents included in the resource do not always consider the gender perspective.
- 5. Contents are selected to give visibility to the contributions of men and women in the different fields of knowledge, avoiding an androcentric or biased perspective.

5.2 The iconic language is inclusive.

- 1. The iconic language used in the resource is not inclusive.
- 3. The iconic language used in the resource is not always sufficiently inclusive.
- 5. Iconic language is not sexist, care is taken that in group images there is no supremacy of any gender or cultural clichés.

5.3 The written language tends to be inclusive.

- 1. The written language of the resource is not inclusive.
- 3. There is not a sufficiently egalitarian perspective.
- 5. As far as possible, the generic masculine and the masculine singular are avoided and, therefore, a change of wording is proposed with a twist that says the same thing with a change of wording using periphrasis or metonymy.

5.4 People with different physical traits and/or who resemble the reality of the students are represented.

- 1. All the people have the same features and are very far from the reality of the student.
- 3. Some people are depicted with different physical features but they do not resemble the reality of the students sufficiently.
- 5. A varied and non-stereotyped human reality is represented, close to the students, avoiding the reproduction of the imaginary created by the mass media, in order to offer a real image of the world.